VIRGINIA:

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR HENRICO COUNTY

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, EX REL. MARK R. HERRING, ATTORNEY GENERAL,

Plaintiff,

v.

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC., an Oklahoma corporation,

Defendant.

CIVIL ACTION NO. <u>CL17</u> - 378 -00

ORDER APPROVING AND ADOPTING ASSURANCE OF VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE

Upon review of the Complaint and the Assurance of Voluntary Compliance, and with the consent of the parties, it is hereby ADJUDGED, ORDERED, and DECREED that:

1. The attached Assurance of Voluntary Compliance is hereby approved and adopted as an Order of this Court; and

2. The Clerk of this Court shall mail a certified copy of this Order to David B. Irvin, Senior Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Protection Section, 202 North Ninth Street, Richmond, Virginia 23219, and Charles E. James, Jr., Esquire, Williams Mullen, 200 South 10th Street, Suite 1600, Richmond, Virginia 23219, counsel for Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.

ENTER: 2,13,17

A COPY TESTE: HEIDI S. BARSHINGER, CLERK HENRICO CIRCUIT COURT

CLERK

Judge, Circuit Count for Henrico County

(MK)

WE ASK FOR THIS:

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, *EX REL*. MARK R. HERRING, ATTORNEY GENERAL

By:

DAVID B. IRVIN (VSB No. 23927) Senior Assistant Attorney General Consumer Protection Section 202 North Ninth Street Richmond, Virginia 23219 Phone: (804) 786-4047 Fax: (804) 786-0122

Counsel for Commonwealth of Virginia, ex rel. Mark R. Herring, Attorney General

SEEN AND AGREED:

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

By:

CHARLES E. JAMES, JR VSB No. 46310)

Williams Mullen 200 South 10th Street, Suite 1600 P. O. Box 1320 (23218-1320) Richmond, Virginia 23219 Phone: (804) 420-6529

Counsel for Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC. By: Stan Lett

Its: <u>Executive Vice President</u>

VIRGINIA:

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR HENRICO COUNTY

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA,)
EX REL. MARK R. HERRING,)
ATTORNEY GENERAL,)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
V.)
)
HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.,)
an Oklahoma corporation,)
)
Defendant.)

CIVIL ACTION NO.

ASSURANCE OF VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE

1. This Assurance of Voluntary Compliance ("Assurance"), arising under and pursuant to the Virginia Consumer Protection Act ("VCPA"), Virginia Code §§ 59.1-196 through 59.1-207, is entered into by the Commonwealth of Virginia, by, through and at the relation of its Attorney General, Mark R. Herring (the "Attorney General" or the "Commonwealth"), and Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. ("Hobby Lobby").

Purpose

2. The execution of this Assurance is for purposes of compromise and settlement and does not constitute an admission by Hobby Lobby that it has violated the VCPA, the Comparison Price Advertising Act ("CPAA"), Virginia Code §§ 59.1-207.40 through 59.1-207.44, or any other statute. The Court Order approving and adopting this Assurance shall not be deemed an admission of any wrongdoing, and shall in no way be deemed an approval, endorsement or release by the Commonwealth, or by any of its agencies or employees, of any advertising or practice, or

claims relating thereto, which are not specifically addressed by this Assurance or the Complaint filed simultaneously herewith.

Parties

3. The Plaintiff is the Commonwealth of Virginia, by, through and at the relation of Mark R. Herring, Attorney General of Virginia.

4. Hobby Lobby is an Oklahoma corporation having its principal office at 7707 SW 44th Street, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73179. Hobby Lobby's Certificate of Authority to Transact Business in the Commonwealth was issued by the Virginia State Corporation Commission on October 1, 2004.

5. Hobby Lobby offers consumer goods including, but not limited to, furniture, art supplies, fabric, frames, and seasonal decor in stores nationwide. Hobby Lobby advertises its merchandise to consumers through a variety of means including print media, internet social media, on-line websites, and in-store signs and pamphlets. In the past, some of these advertisements have referred to discounts off a "MARKED PRICE." The advertisements have further defined "MARKED PRICE" as "DISCOUNTS PROVIDED EVERY DAY; MARKED PRICES REFLECT COMPARABLE PRICES OFFERED BY OTHER SELLERS FOR SIMILAR PRODUCTS." The Attorney General alleges the foregoing practice constitutes a comparison price regulated by Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42, and Hobby Lobby violated Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42(2) by failing to define the trade area to which the advertisement refers. Hobby Lobby denies these allegations.

Jurisdiction and Venue

6. Hobby Lobby consents to and waives all objections to this Court's jurisdiction for all matters relating to this Assurance's entry, execution, monitoring, and enforcement. Hobby

Lobby further waives all objections it may have to venue in this Court for all matters relating to this Assurance's entry, execution, monitoring, and enforcement.

General Provisions

7. This Assurance shall be governed by the laws of the Commonwealth of Virginia. Except as otherwise set forth in this Assurance, this Assurance does not constitute an approval by the Attorney General of any other of Hobby Lobby's services or practices and Hobby Lobby shall not make any representations to the contrary.

8. Nothing in this Assurance shall permit any person or entity not a signatory hereto to enforce or rely upon any provision of this Assurance.

9. The parties agree that this Assurance constitutes legally-enforceable obligations of the parties in accordance with its terms.

10. Apart from this Assurance and the Complaint filed in this action, the Commonwealth shall not institute any civil, regulatory, or administrative proceeding or take any civil, regulatory, or administrative action against Hobby Lobby, its officers, directors, managers, employees, assigns, and agents, under the VCPA or CPAA for any conduct that occurred prior to the date this Assurance is signed by all parties (the "Effective Date" of this Assurance) and approved and adopted as an Order of the Court that is based on any service, practice, act, or omission addressed in this Assurance. The Parties agree that if Hobby Lobby, or its officers, directors, managers, employees, assigns, and agents, provided any materially-false information to the Commonwealth during any settlement negotiations between the Parties, this release shall be null and void.

11. This Assurance applies to Hobby Lobby, together with its officers, directors, managers, employees, assigns, and agents who are responsible for the Hobby Lobby advertising practice set forth in paragraph 5 above.

12. This Assurance constitutes the entire agreement of the parties hereto and supersedes all prior agreements or understandings, whether written or oral, between the parties and/or their respective counsel with respect to the subject matter hereof. Any amendment or modification to this Assurance must be in writing and signed by a duly authorized representative of all parties hereto.

Terms

13. The parties voluntarily agree to this Assurance without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law.

14. Hobby Lobby shall hereafter advertise the practice set forth in paragraph 5 above, only in compliance with the terms set forth below.

15. Hobby Lobby, in its own name or doing business under any other trade name, and its officers, directors, managers, employees, assigns, and agents, with either actual or constructive knowledge of this Assurance shall be permanently enjoined from violating the CPAA by failing to clearly define and disclose the trade area, for any comparison price used in its advertisements and regulated by Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42, as required by Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42(2).

16. When advertising a comparison price regulated by Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42 Hobby Lobby shall, in its advertisements, clearly define and disclose the trade area to which any comparison price used refers, as required by Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42(2). For example, for the advertising practice set forth in paragraph 5 above, Hobby Lobby shall be deemed to meet its obligations under Virginia Code § 59.1-207.42(2) by defining its "MARKED PRICE" in a manner similar to the following:

MARKED PRICES REFLECT GENERAL U.S. MARKET VALUE.

17. Within thirty (30) days of entry of the Court Order approving and adopting this Assurance, Hobby Lobby shall provide a copy of this Assurance to its employees who control the Page 4 of 6

Hobby Lobby advertising practice set forth in paragraph 5 above, and take appropriate steps to ensure compliance with the terms of this Assurance.

18. The Commonwealth agrees that if it alleges Hobby Lobby has violated the terms of this Assurance, it shall promptly provide Hobby Lobby a detailed written notice of the alleged violation(s). Hobby Lobby shall then have forty-five (45) days to respond to the Attorney General's notice, and cure any alleged violations(s).

Civil Penalties and Attorney's Fees

19. The Commonwealth shall recover from Hobby Lobby, and Hobby Lobby agrees to pay the Commonwealth, the sum of Eight Thousand Dollars (\$8,000.00) pursuant to §§ 59.1-206(A) and 59.1-206(C) of the VCPA, as a civil penalty for alleged violations of the VCPA and the CPAA and for reimbursement of the Commonwealth's reasonable expenses, costs, and attorneys' fees in investigating and preparing this action. The \$8,000.00 paid and collected shall be deposited to the Attorney General's Regulatory, Consumer Advocacy, Litigation and Enforcement Revolving Trust Fund.

20. Hobby Lobby agrees to make payment of the amount specified in Paragraph 19 by delivery of a certified or cashier's check, in the amount of Eight Thousand Dollars (\$8,000.00), made payable to "Treasurer of Virginia," and remitted to: David B. Irvin, Senior Assistant Attorney General, Consumer Protection Section, 202 North Ninth Street, Richmond, Virginia, 23219, within fifteen (15) business days of entry of the Court Order approving and adopting this Assurance.

Signatures

21. Each undersigned individual represents that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to enter into this Assurance and to legally bind such Party to the terms and conditions herein.

FOR THE PLAINTIFF: COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, *EX REL*. MARK R. HERRING, ATTORNEY GENERAL

Janid B. By:

Dated: 2/9/2017

David B. Irvin (VSB No. 23927) Senior Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General 202 North Ninth Street Richmond, Virginia 23219 Phone: (804) 786-8789 Fax: (804) 786-0122

Counsel for Commonwealth of Virginia, ex rel. Mark R. Herring, Attorney General

FOR HOBBY LOBBY:

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

By: *e*

Dated:	2-9-17

Charles E. James, Jr. (VSB No. 46310) Williams Mullen 200 South 10th Street, Suite 1600 P.O. Box 1320 (23218-1320) Richmond, Virginia 23219 Phone: (804) 420-6529

Counsel for Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

Bv: Stan Lett

Dated: _____2-8-17

Its: Executive Vice President